Note on Availability of Accessible Versions of 56 Titles Cited by Yochai Benkler in *The Wealth of Networks*

Meredith Filak

November 23, 2009

My name is Meredith Filak. I am submitting these comments in reply to comments by Jane Ginsburg of Columbia University; and by the AAP, IFTA, MPAA, NMPA, and RIAA. The purpose of my reply comments is to provide additional empirical evidence about the benefits of the importation and exportation of accessible-format works.

In an attempt to gauge the availability of specialized books in accessible formats for the blind, I performed a sample study by searching for books cited in the notes of a single book, Yochai Benkler's *The Wealth of Networks: How Social Production Transforms Markets and Freedom.*[1] Due to the unique issues posed by access to books, I focused exclusively on cited books and did not include journals, websites, or newspaper articles in my research.

I searched for works across the five largest English-language Accessible Books databases in three countries: Recording For the Blind and Dyslexic (RFB&D), the National Library Service for the Blind and Physically Handicapped (NLS), and BookShare.Org in the United States; the books database at the Canadian National Institute for the Blind (CNIB); and the library database at the Royal National Institute of Blind people (RNIB) in the United Kingdom. "Accessible format" was defined as any format allowing the use of assistive technology, and included braille, electronic braille, DAISY, downloadable audio, CD audio, HTML and text formats. All books were checked against all five databases twice; once for title, and once for author, to avoid any possible errors in the databases' titles.

Of 56 books cited in the *Wealth of Networks*, only 11 (19.6%) were available in reading-accessible formats, and only one was available under a global license – *Free Culture* by Lawrence Lessig. In Canada, only two books (including *Free Culture*) were available to reading disabled persons. In the UK, two books (again including *Free Culture*) were available for reading disabled persons. Even in the best scenario—the United States—only 11 books were available through at least one of the three American sources.[2]

The 45 remaining books (80.4%) were unavailable in any of the five leading sources of English language works.

Below is the complete list of cited books. The first table lists those books available through one or more of the five sources, and notes the particular format in which each book was made available. The second table lists those which were only available in an edition or compilation separate from the one cited by Benkler. Finally, I report the titles of the 45 works that were not available from the five leading English-language sources for accessible format books.

---

1 The author, Yochai Benkler, has made *The Wealth of Networks* available in a variety of formats and licenses, including the Creative Commons non-commercial attribution license for a PDF version of the original book, but it is not available from any of the five sources in formats specifically designed for accessibility for reading disabled persons.

2 Of these, 2 were found in alternate editions or compilations, different from Benkler's citation.

Books Available in Accessible Formats

Work	RFB&D (US)	NLS (US)	BookShare (US)	CNIB (CA)	RNIB (UK)
Bruce A. Ackerman, *Social Justice and the Liberal State*, 1980	DA, CD	CD			
Erik Barnouw, *A History of Broadcasting in the US*, 1966-70	DA, CD	CD (via RFB&D)			
Robert Ellickson, *Order Without Law,* 1991			DS		
Harold Innis, *The Bias of Communication*, 1951		B, EB		B, EB, DS, DA	
Lawrence Lessig, *The Future of Ideas*, 2001		B, EB	DS, EB, HTML, T		
Lawrence Lessig, *Free Culture,* 2004	DA, CD	CD	DS (Worldwide)	DA, DS	
Amartya Sen, *Development as Freedom*, 1999	CD	DA, CD	DS		To Buy
Paul Starr, *The Creation of the Media,* 2004	DA, CD	CD (via RFB&D)	DS		
Michael Walzer, *Spheres of Justice*, 1983	DA, CD	CD (via RFB&D)			

Key: B – Braille; **EB** – E-Braille; **DS** – DAISY; **DA** – Digital Audio; **CD** – Compact Disc; **HTML** – HTML; **T** – Text

Books Available in Accessible Formats in Alternate Editions or Compilations

Work	RFB&D(US)	NLS (US)	BookShare (US)	CNIB (CA)	RNIB (UK)
Ben H. Bagdikian, *The Media Monopoly*, 1997	2004 edition: DA, CD	CD (1983; 2004, via RFB&D)			
Karl Marx, "Introduction to a Contribution to the Critique of Hegel's Philosophy of Right," in *Deutsch-Französische Jahrbücher,* 1844			DS (in *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts*)		

Key: B – Braille; **EB** – E-Braille; **DS** – DAISY; **DA** – Digital Audio; **CD** – Compact Disc; **HTML** – HTML; **T** – Text

Books Not Available in Accessible Formats

James M. Acheson, *The Lobster Gangs of Maine,* 1988

Anne Alstott and Bruce Ackerman, *The Stakeholder Society,* 1999

Gleason Archer, *History of Radio to 1926,* 1971

C. Edwin Baker, *Media, Markets, and Democracy,* 2002

Albert-Laszio Barbasi, *Linked, How Everything Is Connected to Everything Else and What It Means for Business, Science, and Everyday Life,* 2003

Peter Bernholz and Gerald Radnitsky (eds), *Economic Imperialism: The Economic Approach Applied Outside the Field of Economics,* 1987

Donald Black (ed), *Toward a Theory of Social Control, Fundamentals,* 1984

James W. Carrey, *Communication as Culture: Essays on Media and Society*, 1989

Manuel Castells, *The Rise of Networked Society* (1st & 2nd ed), 1996

Ithiel de Sola-Pool, *Technologies of Freedom,* 1983

Edward L. Deci and Richard M. Ryan, *Intrinsic Motivation and Self-Determination in Human Behavior,* 1985

S.N. Dorogovstev and J.E.F. Mendes, *Evolution of Networks: From Biological Nets to the Internet and WWW,* 2003

Elizabeth Einstein, *Printing Press as an Agent of Change,* 1979

Robert Evenson and D. Gollin (eds) *Crop Variety Improvement and Its Effect on Productivity: The Impact of International Agricultural Research,* 2002

Bruno S. Frey, *Not Just for Money: An Economic Theory of Personal Motivation,* 1997

Bruno S. Frey, *Inspiring Economics: Human Motivation in Political Economy,* 2001

Maurice Godelier, *The Enigma of the Gift*, 1999

Mark Granovetter, *Getting a Job: A Study of Contacts and Careers*, 1974

Jurgen Habermas, *Between Facts and Norms, Contributions to Discourse Theory of Law and Democracy*, 1996

James E. Katz and Ronald E. Rice, *Social Consequences of Internet Use: Access, Involvement, Interaction*, 2002

Duncan Kennedy, *Sexy Dressing Etc.: Essays on the Power and Politics of Cultural Identity*, 1993

Jack R. Kloppenburg, Jr., *First the Seed: The Political Economy of Plant Biotechnology 1492-2000*, 1988

Will Kymlicka, *Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority Rights*, 1995

Lawrence Lessig, *Code and Other Laws of Cyberspace,* 1999

Nan Lin, *Social Capital: A Theory of Social Structure and Action,* 2001

Rich Ling and P. Pedersen (eds), *Mobile Communications: Re-Negotiation of the Social Sphere,* 2005

Robert Waterman McChesney, *Telecommunications, Mass Media, and Democracy: The Battle for the Control of U.S. Broadcasting, 1928-1935*, 1993

Glyn Moody, *Rebel Code: Inside Linux and the Open Source Revolution*, 2001

Richard Nelson (ed), *Rate and Direction of Inventive Activity: Economic and Social Factors*, 1962

Elinor Ostrom, *Governing the Commons: The Evolution of Institutions for Collective Action*, 1990

Jeremy Popkin, *News and Politics in the Age of Revolution: Jean Luzac's Gazzette de Leyde*, 1989

C.K. Prahald, *The Fortune at the Bottom of the Pyramid: Eradicating Poverty Through Profits*, 2005

Howard Rheingold, *Smart Mobs, The Next Social Revolution*, 2002

Philip T. Rosen, *Modern Stentors: Radio Broadcasters and the Federal Government*, 1980

Herbert Simon, *Models of Man Social and Rational: Mathematical Essays on Rational Human Behavior in a Social Setting*, 1957

Carol Tenopir and Donald W King, *Towards Electronic Journals: Realities for Scientists, Librarians, and Publishers*, 2000

Richard M. Titmuss, *The Gift Relationship: From Human Blood to Social Policy*, 1971

Sherry Turkle, *Life on the Screen: Identity in the Age of the Internet*, 1995

Mahbub ul Haq and Khadija ul Haq, *Human Development in South Asia 1998: The Education Challenge*, 1998

Edna Ullman-Margalit, *The Emergence of Norms*, 1977

Harold Varmus, *E-Biomed: A Proposal for Electronic Publications in the Biomedical Sciences*, 1999

Eric von Hippel, *Democratizing Innovation*, 2005

D.J. Watts, *Small Worlds: The Dynamics of Networks Between Order and Randomness*, 1999

Steve Weber, *The Success of Open Source*, 2004

Langdon Winner (ed), *The Whale and the Reactor: A Search for Limits in an Age of High Technology*, 1986